

Annamaria Schiaparelli, 'La fallacia della composizione e della divisione in Aristotele e in Galeno' in *Atti del convegno di Logica Antica tenutosi a Roma (CNR), novembre 2000*, ed. by M. Nasti and M. Alessandrelli, Bibliopolis, Napoli, forthcoming.

ABSTRACT

This paper is concerned with the (so-called) fallacy of combination and division as it is presented in Aristotle's *Sophistical Refutations* and (subsequently) in Galen's treatise *On Linguistic Fallacy*. The aim of the paper is to show how we should be careful in accepting Galen's interpretation of Aristotle's text because we could be led to a misunderstanding of the fallacy of combination and division.

The paper is divided in two parts. The first contains a detailed analysis of Aristotle's *Sophistical Refutations* ch.4, where cases of fallacious combination and cases of fallacious division are presented. A close examination of these cases shows how in Aristotle there are two distinct fallacies (the fallacy of combination and that of division). For, it is possible to find a single pattern of explanation for the fallacy of combination and another (similar) pattern of explanation for the fallacy of division.

The second part of the paper deals with Galen's interpretation of Aristotle's text. A reconstruction of Galen's reading is presented. Finally it is shown how Galen's reading (which focuses on only one Aristotelian example) is to some extent unfaithful to the philosophical idea that underlies the Aristotelian text.