

## Lecture Five: Political Irrationality

*epithumêtikon* (lit, 'what has strong desires'): the appetitive part of the soul

= *philokertes*, *philochrêmaton*: the wealth-loving or money-loving part

*thumos*, *thumoeidos* (lit. 'anger'): spirited part of the soul

*logistikon* (lit, 'what calculates'): rational part of the soul, reason

*pleonexia*: the self-interested, maximizing desire to 'have more' [*pleonektein*] of the good, understood in terms of wealth, status, and power

*the separation rule*: in a just city, wealth and political power must be kept apart: (i) no moneymaker can participate in politics (*the no-meddling rule*); and (ii) no member of the political class may be motivated by wealth (*no-corruption*).

*modularity*: each soul-part is a standing complex ('module') of characteristic psychological dispositions including desires, affect programmes (including pleasures and emotions), environmental sensitivities, and cognitive capacities, all tailored to each other and related by stable causal links

*functionality*: each soul-part, if correctly cultivated, through its characteristic activities provides some important good for the human being as a whole, and contributes at least indirectly to the common good

I. Tripartition:*The Oligarch:*

"And the son, my friend, seeing and suffering this and having lost his substance, is frightened, I suppose, and thrusts love of honor and spiritedness headlong out of the throne of his soul; and, humbled by poverty, he turns greedily to money-making; and bit by bit saving and working, he collects money. Don't you suppose that such a man now puts the desiring and money-loving part on the throne, and makes it the great king within himself, girding it with tiaras, collars, and Persian swords?"

"I do," he said.

"And, I suppose, he makes the calculating and spirited parts sit by it on the ground on either side and be slaves, letting the one neither calculate about nor consider anything but where more money will come from less; and letting the other admire and honor nothing but wealth and the wealthy, while loving the enjoyment of no other honor than that resulting from the possession of money and anything that happens to contribute to getting it." (553b-d)

Ἰδὼν δέ γε, ὃ φίλε, ταῦτα καὶ παθὼν καὶ ἀπολέσας τὰ ὄντα, δείσας, οἶμαι, εὐθὺς ἐπὶ κεφαλὴν ὠθεῖ ἐκ τοῦ θρόνου τοῦ ἐν τῇ ἑαυτοῦ ψυχῇ φιλοτιμίαν τε καὶ τὸ θυμοειδὲς ἐκεῖνο, κἄν ταπεινωθεὶς ὑπὸ πενίας πρὸς χρηματισμὸν τραπόμενος γλίσχρως καὶ κατὰ μικρὸν φειδόμενος καὶ ἐργαζόμενος χρήματα συλλέγεται, ἃρ' οὐκ οἶει τὸν τοιοῦτον τότε εἰς μὲν τὸν θρόνον ἐκεῖνον τὸ ἐπιθυμητικὸν τε καὶ φιλοχρήματον ἐγκαθίζειν καὶ μέγαν βασιλέα ποιεῖν ἐν ἑαυτῷ, τιάρας τε καὶ στρεπτοὺς καὶ ἀκινάκας παραζωννύντα;

Ἔγωγ', ἔφη.

Τὸ δὲ γε, οἶμαι, λογιστικόν τε καὶ θυμοειδὲς χαμαὶ ἔνθεν καὶ ἔνθεν παρακαθίσας ὑπ' ἐκείνῳ καὶ καταδουλωσάμενος, τὸ μὲν οὐδὲν ἄλλο ἔᾶ λογίζεσθαι οὐδὲ σκοπεῖν ἄλλ' ἢ ὀπόθεν ἐξ ἐλαττόνων χρημάτων πλείω ἔσται, τὸ δὲ αὖ θαυμάζειν καὶ τιμᾶν μηδὲν ἄλλο ἢ πλουτόν τε καὶ πλουσίους, καὶ φιλοτιμεῖσθαι μηδ' ἐφ' ἐνὶ ἄλλῳ ἢ ἐπὶ χρημάτων κτήσει καὶ ἐάν τι ἄλλο εἰς τοῦτο φέρῃ.

## II. Thumos:

"And what about when a man believes he's being done injustice? Doesn't his spirit in this case boil and become harsh and form an alliance for battle with what seems just; and, even if it suffers in hunger, cold and everything of the sort, doesn't it stand firm and Conquer, and not cease from its noble efforts before it has succeeded, or death intervenes, or before it becomes gentle, having been called in by the speech within him like a dog by a herdsman?"

"Most certainly, it resembles the likeness you make. And, of course, we put the auxiliaries in our city like dogs obedient to the rulers, who are like shepherds of a city." (440c-d)

Τί δὲ ὅταν ἀδικεῖσθαι τις ἠγῆται; οὐκ ἐν τούτῳ ζεῖ τε καὶ χαλεπαίνει καὶ συμμαχεῖ τῷ δοκοῦντι δικαίῳ, καὶ διὰ τὸ πεινῆν καὶ διὰ τὸ ῥιγοῦν καὶ πάντα τὰ τοιαῦτα πάσχειν, ὑπομένων καὶ νικᾷ καὶ οὐ λήγει τῶν γενναίων, πρὶν ἂν ἡ διαπράξηται ἢ τελευτήσῃ ἢ ὥσπερ κύων ὑπὸ νομέως ὑπὸ τοῦ λόγου τοῦ παρ' αὐτῷ ἀνακληθεὶς πρᾶυνθῆ; Πάνυ μὲν οὖν, ἔφη, ἔοικε τούτῳ ᾧ λέγεις. καίτοι γ' ἐν τῇ ἡμετέρᾳ πόλει τοὺς ἐπικούρους ὥσπερ κύνας ἐθέμεθα ὑπὲρ κούσας τῶν ἀρχόντων ὥσπερ ποιμένων πόλεως.

## III. The Appetitive Part:

### *The Many-Headed Monster:*

"Well then, mold a single idea for a many-colored, many-headed beast that has a ring of heads of tame and savage beasts and can change them and make all of them grow from itself."

"That's a job for a clever molder" he said. "But, nevertheless, since speech is more easily molded than wax and the like, consider it as molded." (588c)

Πλάττε τοῖνυν μίαν μὲν ιδέαν θηρίου ποικίλου καὶ πολυ- κεφάλου, ἡμέρων δὲ θηρίων ἔχοντος κεφαλὰς κύκλω καὶ ἀγρίων, καὶ δυνατοῦ μεταβάλλειν καὶ φύειν ἐξ αὐτοῦ πάντα ταῦτα.

### *The Appetitive Part and Money:*

"And these two, thus trained and having truly learned their own business and been educated, will be set over **the desiring -- which is surely most of the soul in each and by nature most insatiable for money -- and they'll watch it for fear of its being filled with the so-called pleasures of the body** and thus becoming big and strong, and then not minding its own business, but attempting to enslave and rule what is not appropriately

ruled by its class and subverting everyone's entire life." (442a-b)

Καὶ τούτω δὴ οὕτω τραφέντε καὶ ὡς ἀληθῶς τὰ αὐτῶν μαθόντε καὶ παιδευθέντε προσ<ατ>ήσετον τοῦ ἐπιθυμητικοῦ, ὃ δὴ πλεῖστον τῆς ψυχῆς ἐν ἐκάστῳ ἐστὶ καὶ χρημάτων φύσει ἀπληστότατον, ὃ τηρήσετον μὴ τῷ πίμπλασθαι τῶν περὶ τὸ σῶμα καλουμένων ἡδονῶν πολὺ καὶ ἰσχυρὸν γενόμενον οὐκ αὖ τὰ αὐτοῦ πράττη, ἀλλὰ καταδουλώσασθαι καὶ ἄρχειν ἐπιχειρήσει ὧν οὐ προσῆκον αὐτῷ γένει, καὶ σύμπαντα τὸν βίον πάντων ἀνατρέψει.

### *The Appetitive Part and Money II:*

"One part, we say, was that with which a human being learns, and another that with which he becomes spirited; as for the third, because of its many forms, we had no peculiar name to call it by, but **we named it by what was biggest and strongest in it. For we called it the appetitive part on account of the intensity of the appetites concerned with eating, drinking, sex, and all their followers; and so, we also called it the money-loving part, because such appetites are most fulfilled by means of money.**"

"That was right," he said.

"Then if we were to say that **its pleasure and love is of gain**, would we most satisfactorily fix it in one general form for the argument, so that when we speak of this part of the soul we will plainly indicate something to ourselves; and would we be right in calling it money-loving and gain-loving?" (580d-1a)

Τὸ μὲν, φαμέν, ἦν ᾧ μανθάνει ἄνθρωπος, τὸ δὲ ᾧ θυμοῦται, τὸ δὲ τρίτον διὰ πολυειδίαν ἐνὶ οὐκ ἔσχομεν ὄνοματι προσεῖπειν ἰδίῳ αὐτοῦ, ἀλλὰ ὃ μέγιστον καὶ ἰσχυρότατον εἶχεν ἐν αὐτῷ, τούτω ἐπωνομάσαμεν· ἐπιθυμητικὸν γὰρ αὐτὸ κεκλήκαμεν διὰ σφοδρότητα τῶν περὶ τὴν ἐδωδὴν ἐπιθυμιῶν καὶ πόσιν καὶ ἀφροδίσια καὶ ὅσα ἄλλα τούτοις ἀκόλουθα, καὶ φιλοχρήματον δὴ, ὅτι διὰ χρημάτων μάλιστα ἀποτελοῦνται αἱ τοιαῦται ἐπιθυμίαι.

Καὶ ὀρθῶς γ', ἔφη.

Ἄρ' οὖν καὶ τὴν ἡδονὴν αὐτοῦ καὶ φιλίαν εἰ φαῖμεν εἶναι τοῦ κέρδους, μάλιστ' ἂν εἰς ἐν κεφάλαιον ἀπεριειδοίμεθα τῷ λόγῳ, ὥστε τι ἡμῖν αὐτοῖς δηλοῦν, ὅποτε τοῦτο τῆς ψυχῆς τὸ μέρος λέγοιμεν, καὶ καλοῦντες αὐτὸ φιλοχρήματον καὶ φιλοκερδὲς ὀρθῶς ἂν καλοῖμεν;

Ἐμοὶ γοῦν δοκεῖ, ἔφη.

### Works (mostly not) cited:

Appiah, Kwame Anthony, *The Honor Code* (New York, 2010)

Arruzza, C., *A Wolf in the City: Tyranny and the Tyrant in Plato's Republic* (Oxford, 2019)

Barney, R., "What Kind of Theory is the Theory of the Tripartite Soul?", in *Proceedings of the XXXVIIth Boston Area Colloquium in Ancient Philosophy*, G. Gurtler ed., (Leiden, 2016), 53-83

---, Brennan, T. and Brittain, C., *Plato and the Divided Self*. (Cambridge, 2012)

- Bobonich, C., *Plato's Utopia Recast: His Later Ethics and Politics* (Oxford, 2002)
- Brennan, T., "The Nature of the Spirited Part of the Soul and its Object", in Barney, Brennan, and Brittain eds. 2012.
- Burnyeat, M., "The Truth of Tripartition", *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*, 106 (2006), 1-23
- Carone, G., "Akrasia in the *Republic*: Does Plato Change His Mind?", *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy* 20 (2001), 107-148
- Cherry, M., *The Case for Rage* (Oxford, 2021)
- Frowe, H., "The Duty to Remove Statues of Wrongdoers", *Journal of Practical Ethics* 2022 <https://www.jpe.ox.ac.uk/papers/the-duty-to-remove-statues-of-wrongdoers/>
- Kamtekar, R., *Plato's Moral Psychology* (Oxford, 2018)
- "Imperfect Virtue", *Ancient Philosophy* 19 (1998), 315-339
- Kumar, V. and R. Campbell, "Honor and Moral Revolution" [review of Appiah] *Ethical Theory and Moral Practice*, February 2016, 19:1 (2016), 147-159
- Irwin, T., *Plato's Ethics* (Oxford, 1995)
- Lorenz, H., *The Brute Within: Appetitive Desire in Plato and Aristotle* (Oxford, 2006)
- Moline, J., "Plato on the Complexity of the Psyche", *Archiv für Geschichte der Philosophie* 60 (1978), 1-26
- Moss, J., "Appearances and Calculations: Plato's Division of the Soul", *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy* 2008
- Nussbaum, M.C., *Political Emotions* (Cambridge, MA, 2013)
- *Anger and Forgiveness: Resentment, Generosity, Justice* (New York, 2016)
- Price, A.W., *Mental Conflict* (Routledge, 1995)
- Robbins, P., "Modularity of Mind", *Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* 2017 <https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/modularity-mind/>
- Scott, D., "Eros, Tyranny, and Philosophy", in D. Scott (ed.), *Maieusis: Essays in Ancient Philosophy in Honour of Myles Burnyeat* (Oxford, 2007)
- *Levels of Argument: A Comparative Study of Plato's Republic and Aristotle's Nicomachean Ethics* (Oxford, 2015)
- Schofield, M., *Plato: Political Philosophy* (Oxford, 2006)
- Schrieffl, A., *Platons Kritik an Geld und Reichtum* (Berlin, 2013)
- Singpurwalla, R., "The Tripartite Theory of Motivation in Plato's Republic", *Philosophy Compass* 5:11 (2010), 880-892
- "Why Spirit is the Natural Ally of Reason", *Oxford Studies in Ancient Philosophy* 44 (2013), 41-65
- Srinivasan, A., "The Aptness of Anger", *Journal of Political Philosophy* 26:2 (2018), 123-44
- Thakkar, J. "Moneymakers and Craftsmen: A Platonic Approach to Privatization", *European Journal of Philosophy* (2016), 1-25
- Wilberding, J., "Plato's Two Forms of Second-Best Morality", *Philosophical Review* 118 (2009), 351-74
- Wilburn, J. *The Political Soul* (Oxford, 2021)